

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Executive Summary

1.0 Investigation

1.1 Project Overview

After 11 years of peace, tourism and cultural heritage, two of Lebanon's key sectors remain underdeveloped. The impetus for this project was to initiate a thematic discussion of key constraints facing cultural heritage and tourism development in Lebanon as well as to explore the institutional and socio-cultural possibilities and constraints involved in initiating such development in five secondary cities in Lebanon. As outlined by the TOR thematic discussions were to revolve around the preservation and conservation of cultural heritage, the rehabilitation and management of cultural heritage sites, the development of a tourist industry, the enhancement of secondary economic benefits and the integration of historic sites into larger master plans. City based investigations were meant to enhance the strategic links between Tourism, Antiquities, and key "cultural heritage" municipalities and their local communities in the cities of Tripoli, Jbeil (Byblos), Saida, Baalbek and Sour (Tyre). The objectives of such a link was to **(1)** address the problems associated with the degeneration/regeneration of historic cores in select cities, **(2)** enhance employment opportunities in targeted areas, **(3)** suggest sustainable long-term cultural and tourism development plans through the creation of community participation strategies, **(4)** assist in improving the necessary physical and institutional infrastructure for cultural management and tourism and **(5)** improve visitor experience and the management of cultural property.

1.2 Research Tracks

Given the wide scope of the project as well as its multifaceted nature, research focused on identifying a general overview of the constraints and advantages from national, regional as well as citywide perspectives. Accordingly the research carried out was both qualitative and quantitative. It included desk research, informal surveys, group interviews, structured observations, key informant interviews, and on site data collection (see section 2.1 and Bibliography in the full report).

At the national level, research carried out examined the institutional, legislative and operational constraints likely to impede a cultural heritage and tourism development project, and studied the different stakeholders involved. A comprehensive overview of the different tracks that would be necessary for a wholistic approach and according to the themes outlined in the TOR was facilitated by desk research and interviews with key personnel and institutions both national and local. Key stakeholders were identified and a detailed analysis of major institutions, their mandates, organization, problems and some requisite revisions was undertaken (see Appendix II).

At a city-wide level, investigation focused on identifying the different stakeholders involved, their interests and ability to contribute to this project as well as the socio—economic conditions prevalent in the different historic/cultural heritage sites. These were placed within the larger historic and physical scope of the cities in question. Attempts to assess the possible impact of particular proposals on local residents, given their current socio-economic conditions were also made.

In the process several key constraints were faced which determined both the empirical and analytical outputs of the project. The absence of reliable data combined with the limited time frame of the project severely constrained the empirical outputs of the project. The dismal lack of standardized collection techniques and the prevalence of inter-agency bickering, meant that little reliable quantifiable data could be obtained from government institutions be they national or local, especially when the data requested referred to socio-economic and occupancy patterns in the cities in question. When such data was found, spot checking revealed major inconsistencies (for example see section 6.4 in the full report pp. 115-116). With the exception of Saida and Baalbek, where surveys utilized in proposed master plan updates were found, consistent information on the rest of the cities remained elusive. This situation was further compounded by the absence of statistics on property and occupancy patterns as well as proper property registration- something, which is currently being addressed by the recently established National Asset Management Board.

These constraints had clear implications for the analytical outputs of the project. While working out the institutional and legislative possibilities and constraints to cultural heritage and tourism development projects could be carried out with relative ease and precision, a clear exposition of the socio-economic conditions of cultural heritage sites in the individual cities was fraught with difficulty. Consequently, analysis of the socio-economic context for such developments had to rely on first hand observations, stakeholder meetings and discussion forums as well as open-ended interviews with local residents or acknowledged community or religious leaders. The latter were structured around a series of questions meant to identify needs, gauge understanding/reactions to potential cultural heritage and tourism development projects in the cities in question and understand the tenure status and socio-economic conditions of the individuals that were questioned. As such, these meetings and interviews were meant to give qualitative rather than quantitative information especially with regards to some of the questions raised in the TOR such as the needs and fears of local stakeholders: institutions, organizations or communities as well as their perceptions of the project. In the process they also provided a broad overview of the potentials and constraints of linking cultural heritage and tourism development to the alleviation of urban poverty in the individual cities.

1.3 Project Approach

Given those concerns, each of the five cities was reviewed by analyzing successively:

- The regional and local context of the individual cities in question.
- The prevailing as well as potential demand for urban functions located within historic city cores.
- The parameters governing the supply of urban functions in the ancient cores and which could shape the reaction of stakeholders to proposed changes.
- The range of stakeholders including the government, directly affected groups and indirectly affected groups.
- Available experiences that could direct project proposals.
- The complexity of social factors in the cities in question and the significance of social impacts or risks.
- Types of interventions that could be identified inside the ancient cores, whether on private or public properties or outside the cores and at the level of the entire town.

2.0 Analysis

The multifaceted nature of the project as well as the constraints and possibilities inherent to implementing it required a varied analytical approach. Accordingly the project began by investigating the national context for cultural heritage and tourism development including stakeholder groups as well as the institutional, legal and operational constraints followed by a discussion of these constraints within the thematic questions raised in the TOR. It then attempted to locate these issues in the context of the individual cities identified by the TOR.

2.1 National Stakeholders: Thematic Discussion of Key Issues

The diversity of stakeholders, both institutional and social within each of these cities, as well as the overlap in mandates between national and local stakeholders further complicates any initiatives to revive these cultural heritage zones. As such, all attempts to rehabilitate these areas need to insure a comprehensive stakeholder strategy that mediates between conflicting interests, agendas and mandates at both the national and local levels.

National stakeholders include government institutions, community representatives as well as national and international organizations (see table 1 & Appendix II for detailed descriptions of the individual stakeholders, their mandates, organizational problems and some proposed revisions). The following table includes a list of national stakeholders involved in cultural heritage and tourism development and summarizes their concerns, jurisdictions, networks and relevance to the project on a scale of 1-5. Their interactions, conflicts, and potential development is discussed thematically.

2.1.1 Conservation and Preservation of Cultural Heritage

Impediments to the conservation and preservation of cultural heritage in Lebanon reach far beyond the need to coordinate between conservation management and the growth of tourism. **First**, strategic coordination between major institutional stakeholders is problematic and inadequate. **Second**, the current urban legislative framework forms a serious impediment. On the one hand, laws governing cultural heritage continue to rely on the 1933 antiquities law. Restricted to pre-1750 monuments, this law does not take into consideration culturally significant neighborhoods. On the other hand, existing rent caps have succeeded in preserving these areas but hindered their rehabilitation and restoration. **Third** real estate market demand and the lack of financial incentives have helped accelerate the disappearance of heritage buildings. Currently, the real estate value of historic buildings is based on the development value of the land and the assumption that the prospective buyer intends to demolish the existing structure and build a high rise. At the same time, other forms of compensation, such as the enactment of an air rights law that would allow owners of properties of significant historic or cultural value to sell their development rights within specific zones and thus encourage investment in the rehabilitation of these structures and areas, have yet to be considered. **Fourth**, mechanisms of implementation are insufficient. Deficiency in the financial and human resources as well as institutional autonomy hinder the DGA, from fulfilling its responsibilities. At the same time, the lack of co-ordination between the DGA, the DGU and the municipalities has resulted in the intrusion of public roads and buildings and the further degradation of these sites.

To resolve these issues, major administrative reform at the national scale has to occur. In addition, the technical requirements governing conservation standards must be re-examined. In this context, international and local NGO's have played a crucial role through the provision of expertise, fundraising, documentation, research etc. and, in the case of UNESCO, in bypassing administrative red tape. Moreover, the proposed new framework for the DGA, renamed the DGAH, will address two of the most serious bottlenecks hindering the preservation of cultural heritage: fragmented authority over historically significant sites and budgetary constraints (see 3.1).

Stakeholder	Interests, Concerns and Jurisdictions	Relevance to Project	Networks
Institutional			
DGA	Owner of all Archaeological sites. Final authority on restoration, preservation and rehabilitation standards. Must undertake master plans of historic centers with DGU	5	DGU, MOT, Municipalities, Schools, Associations, UNESCO
MOT	Site operation and management. Promotion and documentation. Information booths and tourist facilities. Strategic planning of tourism sector	3	Municipalities, DGU, Orders
Municipalities	Restoration of listed monuments. Expropriation of listed structures. Management of archaeological sites. The right to withhold building permits. The right to comment on master plans for their areas	5	DGU, MOT, DGA, Schools, Associations, Claimants
DGU	Master plans	5	Government, DGA, Municipalities
CDR	Identify needs, locate external sources of finance, preparation of technical documents, tender out select projects	5	All government institutions
MOD	Repatriation of displaced populations	2	Municipalities
Community			
Public and Private Claimants	Owners interested in the development of their properties while tenants would like to see the current rent caps maintained, and their habitats rehabilitated	5	Municipalities
Organizations			
UNESCO	Heritage conservation. Documentation of Heritage sites. Directly involved in three of the cities under study, placed on the World Heritage List. Aids the DGA overcome administrative bottlenecks.	3	MOT, DGA, Municipalities
Associations for the Preservation of Cultural Heritage	Heritage conservation, preservation and promotion.	3	DGA, DGU, Claimants, Municipalities
LAU & AUB	Restoration of listed monuments. Documentation of heritage sites.	2	DGA, Claimants, Municipalities

Table 1: National Stakeholders

2.1.2 Cultural Heritage Restoration, Presentation, Promotion and Appreciation by the Public

Heritage restoration is of direct concern to the DGA and local property owners. However, major bottlenecks and disincentives prevent the DGA and property owners respectively from partaking in most restoration schemes. Public administration laws form a particular obstacle. These include a highly centralized system of governance ill suited for either local governance or the needs of cultural heritage restoration. In this context local and international NGO's play a crucial role in bypassing these bureaucratic bottlenecks and thus in enabling these institutions to carry out their work. At the same time, owners face various impediments such as a complex and tedious bureaucracy, current rent laws and the high financial costs of any restoration effort.

As such, in the absence of a) an amended legislative framework that would consider the particular needs of cultural heritage cities, b) revised and more affordable restoration standards, c) a comprehensive national tourism development strategy; something the Ministry of Tourism is supposed to undertake, and d) of other direct and indirect incentives, private investors and local property owners will continue to shy away from such projects.

At the same time, the presentation, promotion and appreciation of cultural heritage and archaeological sites are characterized by overlapping mandates and the lack of effective coordination between the major stakeholders: the DGA, MOT and local municipalities. No national strategic vision for the promotion of Lebanon's cultural heritage, nationally, regionally and internationally has been drawn up while mechanisms for resolving local disputes over these sites remain non-existent. The continued lack in tourist facilities is detrimental to the promotion of these sites, which, until now, has been carried out in a limited way by local and international NGO's for specific monuments/sites. The new restructured DGAH will resolve some of the bottlenecks related to restoration. However, more effort needs to be spent on promotion, presentation and public awareness campaigns (see 3.2).

2.1.3 Development of a Tourism Industry

Even though Lebanon boasts a wide array of cultural heritage sites and monuments, the tourism industry suffers from the absence of a national vision, an underdeveloped infrastructure, as well as the lack of a comprehensive strategy that would include the different stakeholders. Moreover, strategies for addressing the potential conflict between cultural heritage conservation and tourism development in Lebanon have yet to be formulated.

The absence of a national comprehensive vision has had a significant impact on the development of the industry. First, few promotional campaigns for Lebanon have been undertaken, and no significant market niche has been identified. **Second,** severely damaged by a 15-year civil war, the tourism industry, despite major improvements in the last 11 years, remains ill-equipped to address the needs of the contemporary tourist. Little coordination between the different ministries that are directly or indirectly involved as well as the various related syndicates and associations have taken place. **Third,** prevailing conditions in individual locals further detract from Lebanon's attractiveness to incoming tourists.

Due to fragmented authority, key and secondary stakeholders have undertaken individual efforts, which have not contributed in any significant way to improving the overall tourist potential of the country. As a result, the disjuncture between the needs of Lebanon's tourism sector and the supply of qualified human resources has yet to be addressed. On a micro-scale, no co-ordination has been undertaken with key cultural heritage municipalities.

To address these issues the government needs to adopt a multi-pronged strategy that would include both the public and the private sector and would target the above-mentioned deficiencies. Powers of implementation will be crucial for the success of any initiative. Municipalities can be instrumental in the promotion of symbiosis rather than conflict between the needs of conservation management and tourism. Through incentives or disincentives, the private sector can be encouraged to adopt a long-term view towards a sustainable tourism development policy. Direct incentives could include access to low interest loans and training programs. Indirect incentives can include certified programs that can lead to market advantage as well as select access to specific sites according to qualifications. Disincentives can include fines and levies when a site is negatively impacted. In this instance, environmental impact assessment programs can be launched. Local and international development agencies can help generate the necessary information, and finance the training and certification programs amongst other things.

2.1.4 Creation, Enhancement or Capture of Secondary Economic Benefits

The capture of secondary economic benefits from cultural or tourism related activity has been minimal. Most production is taking place in an ad-hoc manner. Thus far, secondary economic benefits have been limited mainly to the production of handicrafts and artisanal goods. Rather than supporting the industry, the government has entered into direct competition with local NGO's. International experience indicates that the Ministry of Tourism, in coordination with local municipalities and NGO's, can play a critical role in identifying traditional industries that can be revived, produced and marketed such as soap making, traditional wood and metal work, sewing, glass blowing and other folkloric traditions. Local micro-credit NGO's, can be encouraged to provide small-scale loans for the development of tourism related industries. Stakeholders proposed the creation of a government sponsored design center, similar to that established in Tunisia, that would support artists whose intent is to "modernize" traditional designs, as well as address the tangible and intangible aspects of marketing specific products.

2.1.5 Integration of Cultural Heritage into Master Plans

Obstacles which hinder the integration of cultural heritage into master plans vary in nature between the institutional structure of decision making, the particular needs of the relevant institutions, in this case the DGA, the DGU and the municipalities, and the general legislative framework for planning and construction in Lebanon. Even though the institutional structure of decision-making encourages inter-sectoral participation in urban planning studies and master-plan proposals for cities with significant cultural heritage sites, it also hinders local-national cooperation in identifying the needs of these locals. Moreover, shortages in financial and human resources affect the performance of the two major stakeholders: the DGA and the DGU. As a result, and despite various shortcomings, private offices are being commissioned by the DGU to undertake master plans for individual cities including those with significant cultural sites. At the same time, zoning regulations have further aided in the deterioration of these sites and their surroundings. Following the 1960s approach to urban planning, most city centers and their surroundings are classified as commercial zones allowing for maximum exploitation. In the absence of adequate heritage protection laws, this approach to zoning facilitated the progressive destruction of much of the country's heritage.

What is required is a need based and location specific approach that helps identify connections between economic activities, population distribution and urban infrastructure which are critical for identifying bottlenecks such as the cost of land, transportation, limited local material etc. In the absence of legislative changes, and given the complex tenure conditions of current inhabitants, various incentives also need to be adopted to encourage tenant investment in residence rehabilitation. For example, affordable standards, economic benefits from rehabilitation projects etc. can be used to encourage just such investment.

In the long run, the establishment of a regional or city based committees could go a long way in identifying critical concerns and challenges, which need to be addressed by the national government, local institutions and communities. As a forum for stakeholder consultations, such a committee would be used as an institutional mechanism for capacity building, identification of needs, generation of necessary data, analysis and dissemination of information and eventual policy formation for more effective urban management.

2.2 Cities in Perspective

2.2.1 National issues with local resonance

Several of the key issues, which characterize the cultural heritage and tourism sector nationally in Lebanon find particular resonance in the local environment of the individual cities and inhibit diverse development projects. These obstacles are both structural and socio-physical.

2.2.1.1 Institutional centralization and administrative bottlenecks increase the role of local stakeholders

At the structural level, Lebanon's institutional and legislative frameworks are not conducive for addressing cultural heritage and tourism from within a developmental perspective. Administrative bottlenecks have caused a semi paralysis in local policy formation, management and implementation. They have also increased the instrumental role of local stakeholders, especially non-governmental in any proposed project (See 3.1, 3.2 and Appendix II in full report).

2.2.1.2 Rent laws impede restoration and rehabilitation and insure survival of heritage areas and poverty stricken population

Legislative impediments to the development of cultural cores include an outdated antiquities law (see 3.1 in the full report), complex property ownership, occupancy patterns (see 5.4.2 in the full report) and rent regulations. Widespread joint ownership, numerous co-owners, overcrowded tenements, legal caps on rent increases, and tenant protection laws impede the rehabilitation and redevelopment potential of various structures.

Tenancy laws in particular have resulted in stripping landlords of a source of income and a substantial devaluation in the value of their properties.

First, rent caps on pre 1992 rents hinder the preservation and conservation of culturally and historically significant buildings. The loss in income resulting from the maintenance of old rents discourages property owners from investing in the management and upkeep of their properties while tenants cannot afford to rehabilitate their homes.

Second, the cost of tenant evictions for post 1992 rents has prevented owners from demolishing existing structures in an attempt to valorize the value of their real estate, by rebuilding using the maximum percent of exploitation allowed.

Consequently, this rent law has inadvertently insured the continued existence of Lebanon's historic building stock in the form of quasi-intact neighborhoods. It has also guaranteed the continued survival of large portions of the country's urban poor, making any proposed changes in the country's rental law a source of imminent danger to an already marginal population.

2.2.1.3 Population movements, heritage sites and a multitude of stakeholders

Socially, a 15-year civil war, population movements, and deteriorating economic circumstances have contributed to the general physical degradation of cultural sites especially in major cities. The disintegration of local authority during the war, led to ad-hoc growth and environmental pollution of both urban and rural areas (see 3.5 in the full report). At the same time, the sharp increase in Lebanon's urban population from 66.7% in 1975 to its current 88.5% placed tremendous pressure on already strained cities especially their historic cores, where old rents and a dilapidated environment translate into affordable living. This population, according to the UNDP Human Development Report, will rise to 92.6% by 2015 further straining these cities.

The capacities of local institutions and stakeholders to act are limited by a centralized administrative system and deficient financial and human resources while the efforts of local NGO's are channeled into targeting more immediate needs (see 3.1, 3.2 and Appendix II). Local-International cooperation has been effective in some contexts such as Tripoli and ineffective in others such as Sour.

2.2.14 Rehabilitation not a simple choice between pure renovation or restoration

Accordingly, the rehabilitation of the historic urban cores of Tripoli, Saida, Sour, Baalbek and Jbeil, as with other inner cities around the world, is not simply a choice between pure renovation or straightforward restoration for the purposes of tourism. Rather, intervention into such contexts must seek to include local populations, the majority of whom are lower income populations, as an active and integral part of the process of regenerating the urban tissue. Therefore the restoration, rehabilitation and development proposals for each of those cities will have to address a variety of physical, structural and social constraints.

This is clearly evident in the micro-environment of each of the cities considered by the project, where stakeholders include both national stakeholders with direct influence in the individual cities as well as local stakeholders directly or indirectly involved in any potential development project whilst local socio-economic conditions are more varied. The success of any rehabilitation or conservation project is dependant on the effective coordination between these players nationally and locally whilst addressing the particularities of local needs.

2.2.15 Importance of stakeholders contingent upon the project action envisioned

The importance of each of these stakeholders is to a large degree contingent upon the project action envisioned. Stakeholders in all of these cities are composed of government institutions, directly affected groups and indirectly affected groups. Government institutions include national institutions such as the DGA and DGU, and the municipality. Directly affected groups comprise residents, community groups, property owners, local fishermen, and indirectly affected groups of local NGO's who deal with cultural issues or capacity building in the community.

While some, such as the institutional stakeholders, are directly implicated in most levels of decision-making, others are directly affected by all proposed actions such as local communities, vulnerable residents, artisan groups etc. Indirectly affected groups who could be of relevance to the project include intermediary groups such as local NGO's directly involved in cultural heritage issues, other NGO's with vested interests and an operational commitment to the community, as well as international organizations who could act as a source of funding and expertise. In this context, project designs have to be flexible and responsive to change.

A rapid assessment of current and potential stakeholders in historic cores of Tripoli, Sour, Baalbek, Jbeil and Saida was used to outline their relevance to specific actions (on a scale of 1-5). These were combined with **an analysis of significant case studies** so as to determine **the current impact of their actions**, indicated as either positive or negative and sometimes both where the intent is sound but the application problematic. Their potential for future involvement in outlining design priorities and functional redistribution was also assessed.

2.2.1.6 Physical, environmental and socio-economic conditions will have a determining impact.

Moreover, prevailing physical and environmental conditions, as well as the socio-economic circumstances of local inhabitants, their aspirations, needs, fears and wants will have a substantive impact on the successful implementation of any proposal in each of these cities. While the varying degrees and types of physical deterioration and environmental pollution will determine some project priorities, the degree of involvement, acceptance and ownership by residents will have a decisive effect on the success of most proposed projects.

2.2.2 Tripoli

2.2.2.1 Physical and Social Characteristics of Tripoli

- Tripoli exhibits great potential to act as a node into nearby regions such as Batroun as well as the Syrian hinterland. Currently, and despite the absence of an overall vision for the city's development, Tripoli is a regional center for surrounding populations.
- The lack of private and public sector investment in productive industries, which further compounds poverty.
- The main boulevard forms a physical and psychological barrier between the historic core and the rest of Tripoli. Access across the river Abu Ali takes place primarily through al-Zehrieh along the Khan el Askar area causing a major transportation bottleneck.
- Historic neglect by the state and the absence of any governmental institutions.
- Physical degradation, environmental and acoustic pollution. The Abu Ali river cuts the historic city in two.
- High-density population and overcrowding.
- High levels of urban poverty.
- Conservative and traditional social fabric.
- Varied cultural heritage sites of different time periods including a crusader castle and a Mamluk urban fabric, claimed by different historians as the second most important Mamluk city in the world.
- The ancient core can be subdivided into four parts, each boasting a distinct set of characteristics. These contain more than 12% of the total primary housing units in municipal Tripoli. (see Map 6 and Table 1 in section 5.4.1 in full report)

2.2.2.2 Stakeholder Analysis

Assessment of the stakeholder and case studies made clear:

1. **The importance of the municipality and locally active groups for effective implementation.** The current involvement of local universities and NGO's should be encouraged.
2. **National-local coordination between stakeholders is fraught with difficulty. The centralization of various decision-making mechanisms has had a detrimental impact on planning, renovation and rehabilitation efforts in the old city.** The adverse impact exerted by current regulations as well as existing tenants, owners and local communities in restoration efforts (see section 5.3.3 in full report) pointed to the need for revised restoration, conservation and construction standards among other measures.
3. **Absence of an institutional or organizational set up to insure coordination and cooperation amongst the different stakeholders** (see section 5.3.3 in full report). Stakeholders pointed to the need for an historic city steering committee to direct its development priorities.
4. **The absence of community groups to mitigate the adverse impact** of any rehabilitation effort on resident populations (see sections 5.3.3 (Souk el Sagha) and 5.4 in full report)

Stakeholder	Site Operation	Physical Rehabilitation				Urban Regeneration
		Preservation, Conservation	Restoration, Rehabilitation	Master Plans	Infrastructure	Project Design & Priorities
Institutions						
MOT	5 -					
MOC, DGA	- 5	5	+ - 4			3
MOPW, DGU		5	+ - 5			
Municipality	2 - 5	5	+ - 4		5	5
Chamber of Commerce						3
CDR					5	2
Cultural & Educational						
Lebanese University		2 ++	2 +			1
Community						
Private Property Owners		4 - 4	-			3
Sunni Waqf		4 + - 4	+ -			3
Tenants		2 - 2	-			2
Squatters			-			
Artisans		2 + - 2	-			2
Islamic Groups		3 + - 2	+ -			2
NGO's						
APAHT, Culture		2	2			2
Intermediary						2
International						5
Med-Urbs		1 ++	1 ++	2 ++		
The German Government		1 +				

Table 2: Stakeholders in Tripoli

2.2.2.3 Analysis: Structural, Physical and Stakeholder Concerns

The problems and obstacles outlined by the stakeholders included

1. The lack of funds and historic neglect of the old city of Tripoli by all government institutions. According to stakeholders, this has translated into a symbolic divorce between the core and the rest of the city.
2. Difficulties in reclaiming private property, caused by administrative red tape and delays in processing applications. The stringent relationships between the landlord and tenants also hinders the surveys of old buildings.
3. Deficiency in health facilities and schools.
4. Traffic congestion in and around the historic core.
5. Absence of a coordinating body.
6. Treatment of the edges: namely the Abu Ali River and its extension into Bab al-Tabbaneh.

7. Rundown buildings/decay, haphazard restoration. The severe state of decay of around 40 residential structures.
8. Deteriorated physical infrastructure reflected in an ineffective sewage system and inefficient water and electricity networks.
9. Inadequate street lighting, street pavements, parking lots, public spaces and landscaping.
10. Inefficient services. Inept garbage collection has transformed the river and the streets of the old town into dumping grounds.
11. Vegetable market in the old city should be relocated outside the city.

In addition other issues identified by the consultants were:

12. The absence of national planning policies and a strategic vision for the country's cultural heritage sector coupled with the prevalence of a highly centralized system of decision making has negatively impacted local performance. As the rehabilitation of the Jewelers' Souk in Tripoli demonstrated, no clear voice of authority over procedural and implementation issues exists in Tripoli.
13. As discussion workshops with different stakeholders indicated, even though there seems to be a collective recognition by most stakeholders of the economic value of cultural heritage preservation and rehabilitation projects for their city, neither a clear vision nor mechanisms for implementation could be outlined. The key coordination issues facing conservation, restoration and tourism development efforts, underlined by the various stakeholders, were administrative and physical. They included questions such as the distribution of roles and tasks between public offices, ministries and departments as well as infrastructural deficiencies. Moreover, apparent agreements over tourism related activities do not extend to the details of these activities. As articulated by one stakeholder, "in principle they all agree, but when it comes to implementation, that is where the problems start."
14. Given their precarious tenure status both commercial and residential tenants are extremely wary of potential revisions to the country's rental laws. Current tenants believe that this law has the potential to displace them from their homes and stores. Given the current confusion within the community around what the CHTD project entails, this issue could form a particular obstacle to its development. Ownership of any proposed project will therefore have to begin by stabilizing the precarious position of many of the inhabitants by addressing this specific concern.
15. In the absence of incentives and support frameworks, many of the remaining traditional trades are disappearing while newcomers lack the effective know how.
16. The continued marginalization of local residents in rehabilitation efforts, as was evident in the case of the Jewelers souk will be detrimental to the project.
17. Finally, even though the subdivision of the historic core into five sub zones with distinct characteristics facilitates the potential, mode and scope of intervention, a clear overview of the needs of the individual communities remains absent. In this respect, a more in depth survey and a series of participatory appraisal workshops over a long period of time would help determine the particular needs of the communities in question, beyond questions of infrastructure. In turn, this would aid in the development of a long-term sustainable development policy with realistic expectations of what is possible and what is impractical.

2.2.3 Sour

2.2.3.1 Physical and Social Characteristics of Sour

- Sour serves as a regional center with potential for growth, characterized by incoming rural-urban migration and outgoing emigration, mainly to the Gulf, Africa and the US.
- A rich cultural heritage and significant international interest guaranteed Sour a position on UNESCO's World Heritage list in 1984.
- Sour's proximity to Qana and other archeological/Biblical zones in the area, as well large stretches of sandy beaches make it a favorable node in different kinds of tourism: cultural, leisure or biblical.
- Visitor turnover to Sour continues to be severely affected by regional political instability.
- A maritime location with a particular orientation to the sea and a renown fishing industry, even though in decline.
- Historic Sour is a virtual archaeological site that covers an area with a 7,000-year history and almost continuous human habitation. Archaeological remains occupy almost 50% of historic Sour. These are mainly from the Phoenician and Roman eras.
- Almost 50% of property in the historic core is public property comprising of archaeological sites and their surroundings or maritime property. The rest are privately owned by the waqf and individual owners.
- Archaic urban growth, and a high-density low-income population characterize the old city and new developments. A Palestinian refugee camp is adjacent to one of the archaeological sites.
- The historic core boasts a multi-confessional dynamic.
- Local stakeholders are particularly active in issues related to the city's heritage, both negatively and positively.
- Of the 2000 families that inhabit the old city, 20% or 400 families work in the fishing industry. The rest are employed in the public sector, mainly as blue-collar workers or they run small commercial enterprises that consist mainly of household appliances and products, groceries, bakeries, or meat and fish vendors.
- Even though geographically marginal, and unlike Tripoli and Saida, the historic core of the city is a lively and vibrant hub fully accessible and often frequented by the inhabitants of greater Sour and the region. **Main attractions for local inhabitants are:** administrative functions such as the Serrail, the municipality, the local police force, the prison, the tribunal, and the technical office for urbanism, as well as local meat, vegetable and fish market. **Primary attractions for regional and foreign visitors:** archaeological sites (for national, regional and international tourists), the fish market and communal garden for local inhabitants of the old city and Sour as a whole.

2.2.3.2 Stakeholder Analysis

Stakeholder and case studies assessment made clear:

1. The centrality of the municipality, local property owners and residents in any proposed project is quite evident. Moreover, unlike Tripoli private property owners have had been increasingly involved in the rehabilitation of different parts of the historic city, making them pivotal players in any urban regeneration efforts.

2. Given the size of archaeological sites and their location near and probably below the old city, national stakeholders such as the DGA, the MOT and the MOPW play a critical role in the micro-environment of the city (see section 6.3 in the full report).
3. Prospects for community participation are quite positive in the light of previous experience around Hadiqat el Kharab (see section 6.3.2 in the full report).
4. Local NGO's are extremely active in poverty alleviation measures, especially in the fishermen community.
5. Both local and international cultural heritage organizations have been caught in the extreme politicization of cultural heritage in Tyre.

Stakeholder	Site Operation	Physical Rehabilitation				Urban Regeneration
		Preservation, Conservation	Restoration, Rehabilitation	Master Plans	Infra-structure	Project Design & Priorities
Institutions						
MOT	5 -					
MOC, DGA	5 -	5 -	5 +-	4		2
MTPW, Maritime Property			5 +-	4		
MTPW, DGU		3		5	5	3
Municipality	5 -+	5 -	5 +-	5	5	5
CDR					5	
Cultural & Educational						
Lebanese University		1 ++	2 +			1
Community						
Private Property Owners		4 -	4 -			5
Catholic Waqf		2 +-	3 +-			5
Tenants		1 -	1 -			3
Squatters			-			1
Commercants						4
Al Baqa'						4
Political Parties						
Amal						3
NGO's, Cultural						
NAPHSL		1	1			3
NCPT						1
NGO's, Community Development						
ADR						4
International						
ICPT						0
UNESCO						2

Table 3: Stakeholders in Sour

2.2.3.3 Analysis: Structural, Physical and Stakeholder Concerns

The problems and obstacles outlined by the stakeholders were:

1. Freezing of property by the DGA.
2. Advanced state of decay of key historical buildings like the residential quarters, the cathedral, and the Ottoman houses. Difficulty in implementing DGA guidelines in renovation and restoration leads to the haphazard restoration of individual structures.
3. Lack of communal facilities such as a fire department, new schools and health services.
4. Lack of tourist facilities. Coffee houses and toilets are non-existent.
5. Absence of tourist pedestrian itineraries and the lack of public spaces next to key historic buildings and archaeological sites.
6. Marginalization of the local community in decisions related to conservation, preservation and renovation.
7. Citizens do not see any economic benefit from the rich heritage of Sour.
8. Decay in local handicrafts, mainly ship building. The fishermen labor force is shrinking in size and its seasonal activity is on the decline. No alternative activities for the local residents to draw a supplementary income.
9. The obstruction of citizen access to the hippodrome through the construction of fences. While this is protecting the archaeological heritage of the city, it has also marginalized them from what they consider as a major public space in the city.
10. Blurred boundaries between the old town and its modern surroundings, resulting in the absence of clear points of access to the old city. This has led to poor landscaping and vehicular congestion of a number of open space areas such as Sahat al-Manshiye.
11. Poor infrastructure: an obsolete sewage system and water network. The sewage outlet into the sea near the old city is an environmental hazard.
12. Garbage and debris collection from the old city is badly organized. A huge garbage dump exists on an empty lot in the Muslim quarter of the old city. Garbage is also dumped into the harbor resulting in environmental pollution of sea and adjacent residential areas.
13. The current location of the abattoir and fish market in the Muslim quarter of the city.

In addition other issues identified by the consultants were:

14. The physical expansion of Sour means that the old town is increasingly remote from the city's center of activity now located closer to the northern highway connecting the region to the rest of the country.
15. The enlargement of archaeological sites separating the old city from its extensions further accentuate this phenomenon, which makes the preservation of the old town easier and its revitalization more difficult.

16. Major structural constraints to restoration and rehabilitation projects are reflective of national bottlenecks. Rules and regulations governing access and use of archaeological and cultural sites or buildings nationally have a severe and profound impact in cities such as Sour with large swaths of exposed archaeological sites in the midst of an inhabited and constantly evolving urban setting. **First** the length of time required for getting a permit for renovation and rehabilitation to commence is discouraging for many. **Second**, the low-income level of the residents makes it impossible for most of them to comply with stringent technical requirements.

In turn this has encouraged bad restoration and rehabilitation efforts, which fail to meet minimal requirements. **Third**, inadequate compensation and the process of freezing property for several years discourages owners from declaring any archaeological finds accidentally discovered on their sites. Overall, these facts have diminished the value of cultural heritage to local populations and generated further schisms between different stakeholders be they institutional or NGO's.

17. Long term interest by local, national and international communities in Sour's heritage has not translated into an effective future vision for the city or a plan of action targeting its cultural heritage. In part, the politicization of cultural heritage issues, common the world over, has translated into an acute turf war in Sour resulting in the evident absence of a collective agreement over the future of the city. As a result, coordinated effort by or between different stakeholders, whether institutional such as the DGA, the DGU and the municipality, or NGO's such as the ADR, the NAPHSL and UNESCO, amongst others, has focused on small-scale projects and monumental buildings. Despite their importance, these projects have had a limited impact on the immediate livelihood of the city's inhabitants.

18. Existing interest by property owners in the renovation and restoration of the city is not being channeled into an overarching plan for the development of the historic city. Consequently, as the discussion workshops and interviews with different stakeholders indicated, while an overview of physical, infrastructural and administrative problems facing the city were articulated, no stakeholder strategy was proposed.

19. Moreover, despite this collective interest by the community in the archaeological and touristic potential of the city, the non-existence of effective communal representation has meant that little effort is expended to integrate the inhabitants into a larger framework for the restoration, rehabilitation and development of the city.

20. Finally, around 90% of current inhabitants are tenants fearful of revisions to rent laws and/or their potential displacement by the eventual gentrification of the area as a result of renovation and rehabilitation projects.

Overall, these facts have diminished the value of cultural heritage to local populations and generated further schisms between different stakeholders.

2.2.4 Baalbek

2.2.4.1 Physical and Social Characteristics

- Baalbek city, which sits in a region surrounded by the vast agricultural plains of the North Bekaa, lacks real sustainable industries. Infrastructure for the mechanization, production and export of agricultural products is inadequate. Agro-industrial outlets are scarce and other existing small-scale handicraft industries are dwindling.
- Around one-third of the population of the Baalbek region, are reportedly non-residents. Estimates for the total population of the region vary. FAO and UNDP estimates suggest that the total population of the region falls somewhere between 472,580 and 477,205 in 1997 and 1995 respectively, including non-residents (see 7.0 in the full report).
- A large majority of this population is employed in the agricultural sector.
- Social structure is characterized by strong tribal traditions.
- Overall, the region suffers from high levels of illiteracy.
- Anarchic development along the main highway axis into the area.
- Major economic depression following the eradication of illicit crops.
- Cultural heritage and tourism development in the region is severely affected by national bottlenecks, especially legislative and administrative.
- The micro-region of Baalbek city, of which it is the administrative and economic center, contains 93,000 inhabitants (see 7.4.1 in the full report).
- Dense urban populations surround archaeological and cultural sites. The city itself is said to be home to some 50,000 inhabitants, a large portion of whom are regional rural migrants, further augmenting its lower income populations.
- Baalbek's cultural heritage includes one of the most internationally renowned archaeological sites. It attracts an estimated 80,000 visitors yearly. However, the city suffers from an underdeveloped tourism infrastructure, the local community sees little benefit from these activities.
- The degradation of archaeological remains has been accelerated by the encroachment of unauthorized construction onto some of those sites.
- Acute congestion in the city center. Poor accessibility between different quarters.
- High unemployment and poverty.

2.2.4.2 Stakeholder Analysis

Assessment of stakeholders and case studies made clear:

1. Given the regional context of Baalbek and the specific physical and socio-economic conditions prevalent on the ground, civil society and NGO's will be critical to the project.
2. National institutions, such as the DGA, MOT, and DGU play a critical role in revitalization efforts in the Baalbek. As in other contexts, cooperation between those institutions and regional or local authorities such as the municipality must be facilitated and streamlined. Other groups are directly affected by all proposed actions, especially current inhabitants.
3. Local-National-International cooperation has been relatively successful within the limited* domain of archeological preservation, conservation and exhibition (see case studies). However, this cooperation has yet to affect the rest of the city.

Formatted: Bullets and Numbering

Stakeholder	Physical Rehabilitation					Urban Regeneration	
	Site Operation	Preservation Conservation	Restoration, Rehabilitation	Master Plans	Infra-structure	Community Development	Project Design & Priorities
Institutions							
MOT	5	-					
MOC, DGA	5	-	5	+	4		2
MTPW, DGU		3			5	5	3
Municipality	5	-/+	5	-	5	5	5
Cultural & Educational							
LU and AUB		1	++	2	+		1
Community							
Private Property Owners		4	-	4	-		5
Catholic Waqf		2	+	2	+		5
Sunni Waqf		2	+	2	+		
Husseini family		2	+	2	+		
Political Parties							
Hizbollah						3	+/-
NGO's, Cultural							
UGA						2	4
International Organizations							
UNDP						4	
CHF						3	
UNESCO							2
The German Government	4	+		3	+		2

Table 4: Stakeholders in Baalbek

4. International organizations could play a larger role in restoration and regeneration efforts.
5. Local professional associations and organizations are actively interested in using the city's cultural heritage to promote the economic development of the city through tourism and other kinds of activities.
6. The international reputation of the Baalbek temples can be used to build a successful alliance between current stakeholders to revive the city.
7. Current inhabitants, most of whom live on their properties often in immediate proximity to cultural heritage sites, are equally critical stakeholders in the future development of the city. However, they continue to be alienated both from the decision-making process as well as the heritage that exists in their midst.

2.2.4.3 Analysis: Physical, Social and Stakeholder Concerns:

The problems and obstacles facing the city as outlined by the stakeholders are:

1. Decay of key historical buildings and some archaeological sites and the haphazard restoration of individual structures.
2. Encroachment of residential and irregular construction onto archaeological sites.

3. Lack in communal facilities as well as other services such as health and education. And absence of landscaped and public spaces.
4. Rehabilitation of Physical Infrastructure: Water and sewage networks need to be rehabilitated and directed away from the city's archaeological sites. Electrical networks need proper upgrading and restoration. Sewage network is directly connected to Ras al-Ain river causing environmental pollution.
5. Traffic congestion between Ras al-Ain and the citadel. Suggestions were made by local stakeholders to transform this street, or a section of it, into a pedestrian route.
6. The need for clear specifications to regulate certain activities such as butchereries.

In addition, other issues identified by the consultants:

7. **Promotion:** Most promotional activity so far has focused on the temples or citadel area. As a result there is considerable public ignorance about other sites around the city.
8. **Facilities:** The lack of tourist facilities and Baalbek's wartime reputation as a bastion of the conservative Hizbollah have been detrimental to the development of extensive tourist activity. Currently most visitors stay only a few hours, to visit the temple en route to another destination.
9. **Coordination:** Little effort is exerted to coordinate between the different institutions such as the DGA, the municipality and the MOT over specific activities be they restoration or promotional efforts. Moreover, and as outlined in the national stakeholder analysis, the municipality, even though active in Baalbek, has very limited leeway to implement its projects. The most it can do at this point is coordinate with the DGU. However, the DGU is only required to consider the views of the municipality.
10. **Initiatives:** Stakeholder initiatives, such as those of the Husseinis and others remain sporadic and uncoordinated. However, there are increasingly significant efforts being undertaken by local associations and NGO's.
11. **Socio-economic:** Socially, current population profile indicates high levels of unemployment and illiteracy often higher than the national average. Inhabitants in this area also feel and are to a certain extent marginalized. They lack basic access to infrastructure and basic public services such as health, education etc. As such any regeneration efforts in the city have to integrate vocational training programs, especially ones related to the tourist industry. In addition public awareness campaigns that inform and involve citizens over cultural heritage issues will be important for the eventual success of the project.
12. **Regional considerations:** These include the absence of real industries, high levels of poverty and an insufficient infrastructure connecting the city to its wider context. In addition, a coherent cadastral plan for current land use and occupancy patterns in the region needs to be developed.

2.2.5 Jbeil

2.2.5.1 Physical and Social Characteristics

Cultural heritage and tourism development in Jbeil has to address several of the problems which characterize the national scene; that is the lack of institutional and legislative frameworks, the absence of a multi-sectoral approach, deficiency in financial and human resources, deteriorating urban environments and complex tenure conditions etc.

Locally, other issues unique to Jbeil will pose a distinct challenge/advantage to any project. Some of these characteristics are:

- The historic city is well preserved.
- Very low incidence of residence in the city. Today only 40 families live in the area, the majority of whom are property owners.
- Poor visitor turnover.
- Surrounding populations rarely frequent the historic core.
- Current plans to extend the port could threaten the environmental and historic character of the ancient core.
- Jbeil is a regional node in rural urban migration from its own caza and the area of Batroun.
- The proximity of the Aamchit and Batroun beaches render the combination of different forms of leisure and cultural tourism possible.
- The city is a world heritage site.

2.2.5.2 Stakeholder Analysis

Stakeholder and case studies assessment made clear:

1. The importance of both the DGA and the municipality for effective local implementation is evident. The current cooperation between the two institutions, due in a large part to the cooperation between the ex-Mayor, currently the Minister of Telecommunications, and the Minister of Culture must be institutionalized.
2. Local private property owners, most of whom live on their properties, are equally critical stakeholders in the future development of the city.
3. The success of any eventual projects in Jbeil is more contingent on the effective involvement of national stakeholders than other contexts. For example, strict regulations imposed over the development lead to the musification of the old city and the eradication of its functional diversity. This has generated a conflict between the municipality and the DGA over the potential uses of the site.
4. International Organizations could play a potentially important role in promoting the city as a center for the humanities that builds up on its historic myths and traditions.
5. The existing network of local cultural organizations could also play a powerful role in the economic revival of the historic core.

Stakeholder	Physical Rehabilitation				Urban Regeneration		
	Site Operation	Preservation, Conservation	Restoration, Rehabilitation	Master Plans	Infra-structure	Project Design & Priorities	Functional
Institutions							
MOT	5 -						5
MOC, DGA	5 -	5 +	5 +-	4	1 -	2	5 --
MTPW, Maritime Property				2	5*	3	5
MTPW, DGU		3 +	3 +	5	5	3	3 -
Municipality	5 -+	5 -	5 +-	5	5	5	
Cultural & Educational							
LAU							3
Community							
Private Property Owners		5 +	5 +			2	4 +
Sunni Waqf		3 +/-				2	3
Catholic Waqf		3 +	2 +			2	
Maronite Waqf						2	
Armenian Waqf						4	3
Shop Owners' Association		4 +	3 +			2	4 -
NGO's, Cultural							
Foundation Cardahi			1 +			1	2
"Friends of Byblos" Association						1	2
International							
UNESCO, Centre International des Sciences de l'Homme						1	

Table 5: Stakeholders in Jbeil

2.2.5.3 Analysis: Structural, Physical and Stakeholder Concerns

The problems and obstacles outlined by the stakeholders were:

1. Need for improved tourist services
2. Rehabilitation of infrastructure: the sewage system, water networks, streets repair, garbage collection and street illumination
3. Need for health centers and schools
4. Garbage dumps are inadequate. A recycling plant is necessary.
5. Careful rehabilitation of the port is critical

6. Maintenance and preservation of the old houses is necessary to attract tourists.
7. Construction of public toilets and visitor information centers

In addition, other issues identified by the consultants:

8. The civil war in Lebanon had both a positive and negative impact on the city of Jbeil. On the one hand, commercial and service oriented activities grew re-enforcing its position as a pole of attraction for the area. On the other hand, this growth translated into ad hoc construction and rapid urbanization.
9. Whilst the city as a whole and the area in general expanded and grew, the renovation and rehabilitation schemes undertaken during the same period succeeded in emptying the historic core of Jbeil of its inhabitants. At the same time all economic and commercial activity was either frozen or discouraged.
10. The continued presence of a small but affluent number of property owners has insured the absence of the social and economic schisms present in other historic cores.
11. While private property is controlled primarily by a handful of affluent families, expropriations carried out by the DGA insured their ownership of around one third of the historic core (see Table 1 in 7.0 in full report) excluding the archaeological sites. Waqf ownership restricted in part to religious structures, with the exception of the Sunni waqf, which owns the Khan and part of the Ottoman souks. In general, while the majority of private property is located along the waterfront and within the old city, and consists to a great extent of residential structures, a large percentage of waqf properties mark the boundaries of the historic core of the city. These will have considerable impact on the development of the edges of the city.
12. Even though relatively well maintained and accessible, the old city has little to offer surrounding local population and incoming tourists.
13. However, the city has significant potential both for tourist development and increased local and international visitor activity. Today the city attracts the second-highest number of visitors in the country after Baalbek.
14. Moreover, the rich history of the city makes it an ideal candidate for its development into an international and local center for culture and humanities.
15. The most important obstacle that the city faces today is the continued freeze of economic development in the ancient quarter and hence its continued isolation from its own immediate context. This is in part, the result of DGA-led conservation and preservation requirements, and in part the result of the continued conflict between the DGA and the municipality over acceptable functions on DGA-owned sites, comprising a third of the historic city. In addition, private control of the waterfront constrains development, which in the words of one local resident, has resulted in “a monopoly over eating fish.” For any serious economic development initiatives to occur, an institutional mechanism and a redefinition of terms, such as private and public good, have to be undertaken for this “the monopoly over eating fish” to be dismantled.

2.2.6 Saida

2.2.6.1 Physical and Social Characteristics

- **Geographically located at the periphery of the zones of which it is an administrative center**, the city has little influence on the regions, which it oversees.
- **Fast and uncontrolled urban development** over the past two decades has almost eradicated the city's citrus orchards, once its most important industry.
- **Access to the historic core is restricted** to its northern edge along the waterfront. The construction of the new corniche and the expansion of the port have isolated the city from its natural connections to the port and the sea. The completion of the projected waterfront boulevard **will further enhance its physical disconnection from the rest of the city**.
- **The historic core itself is unique** in that it has not been disrupted by urban planning schemes as in Tripoli and Sour and thus continues to exist within **its medieval walls**.
- **Continuously occupied since antiquity, the historic core contains a mix of monuments - residential, commercial, secular and religious** - most of which date back to 400 years of Ottoman rule. Visually it is characterized by a maze of narrow alleyways and superimposed structures from different eras, whilst its urban fabric continues to be structured by a Roman grid (see Map 4, section 6.5 in the full report).
- **Consisting mainly of Lebanese and Palestinian families, the historic core also acts as a place of refuge for most of the marginal population in the city**. This singular social makeup makes it **particularly sensitive to any projected interventions**.
- Characterized by a **conservative social structure, and a strictly patriarchal society, daily life** continues to revolve around the individual neighborhood, while a strict gender division structures communal rhythm.
- **The relatively large size of families, mean that this population is relatively youthful with more than 60% under the age of 25** (see Figures 4, 7 & 8 in section 9.5).
- **Overall the intricate web of superimposed structures in the historic core of Saida means that almost half its structures are mixed use**, namely of residence and one other commercial, industrial or service oriented activity.

2.2.6.2 Stakeholder Analysis

Stakeholder and case studies assessment made clear:

1. Project approach has to focus on the urban fabric and structures directly related to daily communal life rather than on the rehabilitation of monuments, as has been the case thus far. Given **the delicate social constitution of the city**, and the depressed economic status of its inhabitants, and as in the post Israeli invasion, **community participation** will be paramount to the success of the project.
2. Local NGO's that have been involved in community related projects could be involved as key mediators with local inhabitants.
3. The centrality of the municipality, local property owners and residents in any proposed project is quite evident. Unlike Tripoli, a few wealthy private property owners have been increasingly involved in the rehabilitation of different parts of the historic city.
4. Current restoration and rehabilitation criteria and the unevenness of application are detrimental to renovation efforts.

Stakeholder	Site Operation	Physical Rehabilitation				Urban Regeneration	
		Preservation, Conservation	Restoration, Rehabilitation	Master Plans	Infra-structure	Project Design & Priorities	Community Development
Institutions							
MOT	5 -						
MOC, DGA	5 -	5 -	5 +-	4		2	
MTPW, Maritime Property			5 +-	4			
MTPW, DGU	5	3		5	5	3	
Municipality	5 -+	5 -	5 +-	5	5	5	4
CDR	5				5	4	
Cultural & Educational							
LU, AUB, Foreign		1 ++	2 +			1	
Community							
Private Owners		4 -	4 -			5	
Debbaneh Family		1					
Audi Family		5				2	
Waqfs							
The Sunni Waqf		2 +	3 +			2	
Catholic						1	
Orthodox			1			1	
Maronite		2 +	2 +-			1	
Tenants		4 -	2 -			3	
Squatters		1 -	-			1	
Commercants						4	
Political Parties							
Hariri Group						3	
Al-Tanzim al-Shaabi al-Nasiri						3	
NGO's, Cultural							
Sidon al-Turath,		2 +	4 +			3	
CAES						1	
NGO's, Development							
Hariri Foundation							4
Al Tanzim							4
The NGO Assembly						5	5
International							

Table 6: Stakeholders in Saida

2.2.6.3 Analysis: Structural, Physical and Stakeholder Concerns

The problems and obstacles outlined by the stakeholders were:

1. Despite the collective recognition by most stakeholders of the value of Saida's cultural heritage and their apparent willingness to cooperate over the organization and improvement of their environment, no concrete action plan has been drawn up between the different stakeholders.
2. The legal system and DGA imposed technical standards, hinder funding for the preservation of inhabited historic structures.
3. Lack of a master plan to coordinate the overall development of the city.
4. No single coordinating body supervising the execution of projects.
5. Despite increase in restoration activity the impact on the population is marginal.
6. The current renovated structures are like isolated islands within the urban fabric.
7. Most buildings have structural problems. Intervention cannot be limited to the renovation of facades.
8. Rehabilitation and improvement of the sewage, electrical and water systems was badly needed.
9. Absence of green spaces, health clinics, hotels and schools.
10. The need for better and larger roads.
11. With the exception of Rue Mutran, where the renovations undertaken by the Audi foundation have occurred, street lights remain practically non-existent in the rest of the core.

Formatted: Bullets and Numbering

In addition, other issues identified by the consultants:

12. Isolated and inhabited primarily by lower income Lebanese and Palestinians, the historic core is completely marginal to the rest of the city. To the modern visitor today, old Saida looks and feels like a medieval city, while for local inhabitants it is a remote and unknown ghetto, much like the Palestinian camps nearby (see 9.5 in the full report).
13. The specificities of the old city's physical constitution as an enclosed, self contained entity and the particularities of Saida's social makeup make any intervention into the city a socially and ethnically loaded issue. The property structure and current property laws render a large portion of these inhabitants, especially those lacking Lebanese citizenship more vulnerable to any proposed changes. The city's intricate and intertwined physical fabric makes the question of joint property ownership far more difficult to resolve. Overlaps and interconnections between the public and the private render a large portion of the Old City an ambiguous gray color. At the same time, around 50% of local residents are said to be of Palestinian or Palestinian/Lebanese origin (see 9.5.1).
14. In this context and as in Tripoli, while the efforts of the Audi Foundation in renovating an entire zone are to be lauded, the exclusion of inhabitants from the implementation process have been detrimental to the project.

15. National bottlenecks are in clearly evident in Saida's historic core. As in Tripoli and Sour, technical and bureaucratic complexities and prohibitive financial costs discourage owners and tenants alike from investing in the restoration of historic structures. Current property/rent laws further compound these problems rendering the recuperation of old property almost impossible.
16. Saida's proximity to Beirut and recent ease of access provided by the new highways have transformed the city into a transitional node for travelers between the capital and the south of the country. However, its unique physical environment render it an ideal location for leisure activities not available in the capital.

3.0 Recommendations

The overall recommendations of the project can be grouped under four overall headings: strategic, operational, risk and beneficiary recommendations.

3.1 Strategic Recommendations

3.1.1 Strategic Approach and Aim: from tourism to economic development

This linkage between tourism, antiquities, and key "cultural heritage" municipalities and the alleviation of urban poverty implied a significant reformulation of the project's strategic approach. Focus shifted from tourism-oriented projects to the overall development of these sites within the larger economic and social specificities of the individual cities. Tourism oriented activities, emphasized by the TOR were included in a more comprehensive approach that sought the economic and urban development of the cities in question (see section 4.0 in full report).

The aim of the project would therefore be to utilize the cultural and historic wealth of different ancient urban cores, to increase the economic potential within these areas and in their vicinities. By improving the economic and social conditions in the ancient cores the project will 1) facilitate the sustainable maintenance of the urban fabric 2) generate income for the municipalities to expedite subsequent development operations and 3) cover the costs of mitigating actions that have been made necessary by the transformation of the existing situation.

3.1.2 National versus local actions and possible interventions

Any project that attempts to address the above issues has to logistically engage with national conditions as well as the legal and socio-economic conditions prevalent on site. Given the slim likelihood of national institutional and legal (see sections 2.1 and 2.2) reforms in the current macro-economic and political climate, the project was designed to focus on local intervention, most likely to achieve some of the desired results. Accordingly, three broad types of intervention/operational tools, through which an urban rehabilitation and regeneration scheme could be instituted, were identified; Physical Rehabilitation, Urban Regeneration and City wide Interventions (see table 7 and 4.4 in the full report). Of those the second approach is recommended for it directly addresses the complex social, economic conditions prevalent on site, without being directly connected to national scale reforms. The easiest urban planning tool that can be used to implement this process is re-parcelization (section 4.4.2 in the full report).

3.2 Operational Recommendations

3.2.1 Surveys and Data: Eventual project success is highly dependant on an accurate picture of existing socio-economic conditions, especially in Tripoli, Saida, Sour and to a lesser extent Baalbek and Jbeil. In the absence of such data, targeting the local needs and implementing mitigating measures will be haphazard at best. Even though general operational guidelines for the individual cities have been provided in the full report, accurate surveys followed by Rapid Social and Participatory Assessments based on findings, must be undertaken prior to the implementation of any project proposal. Failure to do so will risk projects that do not meet local demands.

3.2.2 Project Organization: Steering committees, with decision making powers, and including all relevant local stakeholders should be established in each city. To avoid the issues faced in the renovation of the Souk el Sagha in Tripoli and Rue Mutran (Audi islet) in Saida, this committee should also include local residential and commercial tenants and not just property owners.

Action	Physical Impact	Social and Economic Impact	
		Positive	Negative
Physical Rehabilitation: Enhancing the Urban Environment	Improved Infrastructure	Some Institutional capacity Building	Freezing of economic activity and monopolization of benefits by tenants (esp. commercial). Increase in price of voluntary relocation (Khlawat)
	Tourist Itineraries	Probable increase in internal tourism	Non refundable/ no gain for local governance
	Rehabilitated facades/overall "look" of areas in question	Revival of traditional artisanal vocations, limited income generation	Short term disruptions in daily activities.
	Limited Environmental Upgrading	Ease of Implementation	Potential gentrification in some pockets - marginalization of residential tenants
			Eventual deterioration of environment
			Accentuation of economic disparity
			Musification
Urban Regeneration of Historic Zones: Functional and Economic Redistribution	Improved Infrastructure	Comprehensive Institutional capacity Building	Difficulty in Implementation: Requires intervention into the private domain either directly or through "soft" interventions such as subsidies or transformation of existing institutional & legislative framework
	Tourist Itineraries	Renewable functions	Potential relocation of residents and functions
	Full environmental Upgrading	Economic and social re-integration of center into city	Short term disruptions in daily activities
	Rehabilitated residences and commercial premises	Even spread of secondary economic benefits: alleviation of poverty	
		employment generation	
		long term sustainability	
		eventual increase in tourism activity	
City Wide Intervention	Same as urban regeneration & improved access to city	Same as urban regeneration & fuller integration into city wide activities	

Table 7: Physical Rehabilitation, Urban Generation and City Wide Intervention

3.2.3 Implementation Tool: Failure to re-plan these cultural heritage zones will result in a musified urban core, as in Jbeil. Reparcelization is the easiest and most cost efficient tool to re-plan some of these zones and insure the regeneration of the urban fabric through sustained interventions into both the public and private domain. It also insures the state some return on initial expenses by granting it 25% of re-organized areas.

3.2.4 Economic Development and Project Fiscality: In the absence of legislative and institutional reforms project proposals should keep a city-wide framework in mind, and try to identify the various urban functions that should be brought in or removed from those ancient cores. These should include urban functions that are characterized by broad attraction radiuses or that significantly help in a more just and even distribution of wealth and activities within each city. However, this process must be accompanied by the proper fiscal and/or regulatory and/or developmental actions that restores to the benefit of the community, part of the transferred wealth. The cost of the following items should be covered:

- **Preservation** and maintenance of the ancient structures and urban fabric
- **Relocation** of the residents and businesses that would need to be moved out.
- **Compensation** for losses that might be incurred by specific stakeholders, either because of expropriation or as a result of distortions in benefit-sharing due to the peculiarities of the legal framework governing ownership, tenure and rents.

3.2.5 Project Design: To insure economic development and project feasibility, project design must integrate four different elements:

- **Accessibility:** Ease of access to the historic core will play a significant role in the success or failure of all proposed projects including treatment of the edges.
- **Creation of New Functions:** Given the marginalization of the inner core, rejuvenating the urban fabric must re create additional economic roles by incorporating symbolic, cultural and touristic functions among others.
- **Rehabilitation of the Urban Environment and Community Participation:** Improvement of infrastructure, quality of services and urban/architectural environment. In the process the inclusion of local communities in the rehabilitation process must be central. In each city a particular pilot project must be chosen to initiate such a scheme.
- **Institutional Capacity Building:** Improvement in the assets or governance of local municipality. Given the current economic and legislative environment, this aspect will to a large degree depend on the form of intervention adopted.

3.3 Risk Recommendations

3.3.1 Economic feasibility and eventual beneficiaries: special legislation for historic cities

The first risk is directly connected to the economic feasibility of the project and eventual beneficiaries. Here maximizing and spreading the benefits of the proposed loan will be seriously jeopardized if the institutional structure of the project is not carefully considered. (see 3.1 and 4.3 in the full report). If special legislation for historic cities is not enacted, the project will not be able to **1)** prevent the increase in tenant relocation fees (*khlowat*), at the expense of property owners, or conversely, **2)** prevent the potential displacement of a good segment of the most vulnerable population, especially in Saida, Tripoli and Sour, **3)** stop the freezing of unwanted economic functions as currents commercial tenants take advantage of physical improvements or

4) halt a concurrent increase in land values, which, in the absence of adequate zoning and protection, will lead to the eventual demolition of these areas.

Accordingly, special arrangements must be enacted to protect cultural heritage buildings or neighborhoods, most of which are currently leased under old contracts. This can occur through a carefully designed mix of regulations that control liberation and prorogation of contracts, and of tax incentives. These could include exemptions from the current tax on built up areas and/or a re-evaluation of rental contracts depending on the building. It should be noted that currently both the 1992 law and 2001 draft contain legislation that allows landlords to evict tenants, irrespective of cultural heritage value of the structure, for the purpose of demolition and construction of a new building. This could pose a substantial threat to buildings and tenants alike. Consequently, and given the transitional nature of rental legislation, laws governing the usage of “cultural” buildings should be issued separately from the rent law. In the process, the differential impact of rent regulation on commercial and residential structures can also be addressed

3.3.2 Enhancement of municipal assets contingent on mode of intervention

The framework of intervention adopted will have a direct impact on the development agenda including potential increase in municipal assets, capacity building and the long term strategic planning capabilities of local governance. If the framework for intervention into the historic city relies on a series of interconnected yet singular public projects, legal mechanisms for improving municipal assets are quite limited while project impact will be restricted. If an urban regeneration methodology is adopted, this will automatically increase municipal assets and enhance the project impact beyond the immediate community (see 4.5 in full report).

3.3.3 Potential displacement of socially and economically marginalized: enhancing community participation and other mitigating measures

The third risk, is concerned with the potential displacement of economically constrained and often socially marginalized populations. Property structures and the precarious economic condition of the inhabitants renders most residents vulnerable to the new rental law revisions. From the perspective of the community members, this law has the potential to displace them from their homes and stores. Given the current confusion within the community around what the project entails, this issue could form a particular obstacle to the development of the project.

This is especially the case in Tripoli, Saida and to a more limited degree Sour, where the presence of large numbers of low-income populations and regional migrants in these areas without effective local political representation, must be seriously accounted for in all project proposals. On the one hand, the marginalization of local residents in past and current restoration and rehabilitation projects meant that the impact of these efforts on the habitats of local inhabitants was quite limited. Resident dissatisfaction could derail efforts to regenerate the area. On the other hand, the country’s voting laws, which require individuals to vote in area of registration, rather than residence, further marginalizes these inhabitants many of whom are regional migrants. They remain without effective representation making them more vulnerable to any proposed changes in the area.

The importance of a comprehensive rather than project oriented approach is necessary for the implementation of as series of **mitigating measures that would address these potential risks.**

1. Establishment of community based groups for consultation and participation. Intermediary agencies such as local NGO's can help set up these organizations. The inclusion of NGO's and local communities in the process- bringing in the municipalities- helping the devolution of local governance- investments should not be in physical rehabilitation alone.
2. To insure local participation attention must be directed to structures most directly related to economic regeneration, the daily life of the community and monuments of historic significance.
3. In this context, a positive perception of the project by local stakeholders combined with a comprehensive exposition of the benefits that will accrue as a result of it will be paramount.

3.4 Beneficiary and Participation Recommendations: city specific proposals

The situation and potential of each of the five cities are significantly different. Structured by appeal, accessibility and relationship of the heritage sites to the city, this difference will play a determining role in identifying the mix of actions required in each context and their respective intensity (see Tables 8 & 9). Appeal here expresses the demand side of the tourist market, accessibility conveys both the ease of access and the capture by Beirut of most of the economic benefits while relationship to the city reflects the geographic, social and economic integration of the core into its surrounding environment.

City	International appeal	Local appeal	Accessibility from Beirut	Relationship of site to the city	
				Geographic	Socio-economic
Tripoli	Medium	Low	Far	Central	Socially & Administratively isolated, Regional economic appeal
Sour	Medium	Medium	Medium	Peripheral	Administrative & economic appeal, social marginality
Baalbek	Very High	High	Far	Separate	NA
Jbeil	High	High	Very close	Peripheral	Musefied
Saïda	Low	Low	Very close	Peripheral	Administrative, socially & economically isolated

Table 8: Appeal, Accessibility and Position of Cultural Heritage Sites in Individual Cities

When combined these indicators have a decisive impact on the kind and intensity of action requested. To give a somewhat global viewpoint and thus enable a cross comparative perspective, these were synthesized in table 9. Directly related to the three types of intervention outlined in the project, these indicators present a modus operandi for defining the critical balance between the different aspects of intervention needed to prevent the complete musification of these locals (if emphasis is placed on physical intervention), the eventual destruction of heritage (if only a city-wide or regional perspective is adopted), and/or the complete ghettoization of the areas (if social integration is not achieved).

In other words, for the project to succeed it must strike a successful balance between physical rehabilitation, local interventions, and city-wide or regional proposals, based on prevalent conditions in each of those cities. Accordingly, the figures proposed in the following table are meant to indicate the mix and intensity of action required, based on prevalent conditions, for project proposals to succeed in each of those cities (Table 9).

	Tourist Appeal	Urban, regional & functional imbrication	Social integration	Global amplitude of action needed
Action Needed	P	C/R	L	
Tripoli	3	3	5	6.6
Sour	2	2	3	4.1
Baalbek	2	1	2	3.0
Jbeil	1	2	1	2.4
Saïda	3	4	6	7.8
Average	2.2	2.4	3.4	4.8

Table 9: Intensity of Action Required

** P: Physical Intervention, C/R: City Wide or Regional Intervention, L: Local Intervention Intensity was action was determined on a scale of 1-3 for Tourist appeal, 1-4 for Urban, regional and functional imbrication and 1-6 for social integration so as to reflect the relative importance and difficulty of implementation inherent to each type of intervention.*

The implications of these tables will be elaborated upon in the recommendations for each city.

3.4.1 Tripoli

The low level of international and local appeal of Tripoli’s urban core, its geographic centrality and social and administrative isolation (despite a regional economic appeal that bypasses the rest of the city), imply that:

1. Much effort has to be expended in improving the physical environment of the city and its tourist “appeal” through the construction of tourist facilities, itineraries and the establishment of Conservation/Preservation Areas. In this context, four areas of cultural significance were proposed as areas of conservation (see 5.5.2.1).
2. Most resources have to be directed at achieving the economic and social integration of the core through local, city wide and regional interventions. These include improved physical and symbolic accessibility, enhanced economic functions, and selected environmental improvements (see 5.5.2 in the full report).
3. Social integration through community participation programs and the incorporation of local communities is paramount. This can occur through the expansion of programs to improve the built environment and which until now have targeted specific public edifices, to include the consolidation of dilapidated structures, the construction of community facilities such as health clinics, and urban landscaping. More specifically, these should target Haddadin and Souaika, the two predominantly residential areas with the highest percentage of apparent infrastructural and physical dilapidation.

4. Given the current confusion about the project and what it involves, some public awareness campaigns should be conducted.
5. In this case, the project's economic impacts should be assessed through three indicators: employment generation, the mobilization of private resources, and the eventual reintegration of the core into the city.

3.4.2 Sour

The relatively average level of international and local appeal of the city's heritage sites, the increased geographic remoteness of the historic core from the city, and its continued social, economic and administrative integration mean that:

1. Urban regeneration of Sour requires intervention at the macro and micro levels. From a macro perspective, for this area to function as an effective pole of attraction, it must be part of a more comprehensive strategy that will integrate the historic city into its larger locale and link its three major characteristics; archaeology, beaches and the fishing industry. From a micro perspective, to invigorate Sour's economic life and provide direct economic benefits to local inhabitants, project proposals for the city must be accompanied by the redistribution and upgrading of existing functions and the creation of new ones (see 6.5.2).
2. Local, physical intervention into the old city must target five intersecting elements: an urban fabric, which is to be rehabilitated and preserved, archaeological zones which need to be delimited, areas, which are to be renovated and upgraded, specific zones or pockets within this area occupied by severely dilapidated structures, individual objects or structures, which are to be preserved according to proposed itineraries and importance of structure.
3. The creation of tourist itineraries should focus on integrating the old city into surrounding archaeological sites, thus helping expand the secondary economic benefits of tourist activity.
4. The current politicization of cultural heritage should be addressed through the inclusion of all relevant local and international stakeholders, especially NGO's conducting vocational training. Along with level of employment generation will serve as critical indicators for project success.

3.4.3 Baalbek

Given the relative disconnection between Baalbek's cultural heritage sites (mainly the temples) and the rest of the city, its relatively high tourist appeal despite the lack of infrastructure, project proposals in Baalbek focused on integrating the city into its sub and regional context

1. Most efforts have to focus on the integration of Baalbek into its regional context and the diversification of activities. At the macro scale, a cultural heritage and tourism development project in Baalbek must begin by considering the regional context of the city and its potential for growth and which would include eco-tourists. At the micro-regional scale, peripheral historic sites in the villages of Younine, Nahle, Douris, and al-Allak, should be made part of promotion campaigns for the region

2. Physical intervention into the existing environment in Baalbek would primarily focus on improving and upgrading the physical infrastructure, public areas and access to the city as well as the creation of communal facilities. As such small-scale projects should be established with the explicit aim of integrating local communities.
3. Of critical importance to this project is the potential for integrating the local community in a fully participatory process. This is particularly evident in the efforts currently exerted by the UGA in collaboration with around 20 local NGO's and other civil organizations, as well as the municipality to rally national and international interest in the Baalbek 2004 project.

3.4.4 Jbeil

The relative social stability of the historic core, its well restored environment and its geographic and functional marginalization, imply that its re-integration into the larger fabric of Jbeil is paramount.

1. Much efforts must be expended at regenerating the old city economically. In the absence of national legislative and administrative changes, access to the center and its re-integration into its local should be addressed at the level of the city's boundaries. This will entail effective coordination with the three religious waqfs that own properties in these zones.
2. Economic revitalization should focus on creating incentives for the development of small-scale commercial enterprises as well as affordable housing units for local residents, students and tourists. At the same time, financial and other incentives need to be provided so as to promote the development of visitor facilities and infrastructure.
3. Physical rehabilitation should focus on the creation of visitor trails through the old city and along its seashore. This would entail the cooperation of the DGA over the archaeological sites adjacent to the seashore (see map) as well as the Armenian waqf. In addition, to counter the city's proximity to the capital, a specific function, not available in Beirut, should be introduced.

3.4.5 Saida

The marginality of Saida's historic core from the rest of the city's social, economic and administrative networks, and its peripheral geographic position and extreme proximity to Beirut means that project proposals have to focus on both physical renovation and urban regeneration in almost equal measure. Failure to do so will lead to a situation similar to that of Jubail today, with a gentrified and for the most part empty center, and/or an isolated ghetto as is the case today.

1. Physical intervention should address access into the center as well as selected environmental improvements. It is recommended that the project select one of the small residential islands as a site for the implementation of a pilot project (see 9.6.3).
2. Conservation/preservation areas and tourist itineraries should target the entire historic core and not just specific monuments, which may still be used as constitutive nodes for these efforts.

3. As in Sour and Tripoli, current restoration and rehabilitation criteria and the unevenness of application are detrimental to renovation efforts. In the light of the current population profile, a revision of these standards and the provision of subsidies would be of benefit to the project.
4. City wide and regional interventions should attempt to address the economic and symbolic isolation of the area. Given the city's proximity to Beirut, the project should focus on the creation of unique leisure oriented activities. In the process the symbolic isolation of the historic core from the larger city should be addressed through the integration of functions of citywide significance (see 9.6.2.1).
5. Community Participation: Local NGO's that have been involved in community related projects could be involved as key mediators with local inhabitants. However, they should also be encouraged to shift their project approach from philanthropy to community development.